Work and Poverty: antagonism and disciplinarization in Social Programs for conditional income transfer in Brazil (1990-2022)[1]

Trabalho e Pobreza: antagonismo e disciplinarização nos Programas Sociais de transferência condicionada de renda (1990-2022)

Denise De Sordi[*]
https://orcid.org/0000-0003-0536-2863
Sérgio Paulo Morais[**]
https://orcid.org/0000-0001-7827-3373

Resumo

Este artigo analisa o processo histórico de conciliação entre as noções de trabalho e pobreza, expresso em programas sociais de transferência condicionada de renda e evidência que aspectos de moralização em torno de modos de vida de trabalhadores empobrecidos adquirem maior relevo do que princípios supostamente técnicos ou neutros para a formulação de tais programas. O texto faz uma revisão bibliográfica com obras que tratam da organização e distribuição de benefícios sociais, além de apresentar fontes de imprensa local e uma entrevista que constitui o acervo de uma pesquisa. O objetivo é o de compreender e explicar como as relações entre Estado e entidades, ONGs e prestadores de serviços atuantes a nível local ao longo dos anos da década de 1990 e início dos anos 2000, ao serem incorporados, como "prestadores de serviços sociais" passaram a um papel institucional de peças chave na rede de proteção social brasileira. Nosso recorte espacial localiza-se na cidade de Uberlândia (MG) em diálogo com o contexto nacional, o que nos permitiu observar como estas dinâmicas contribuíram para a manutenção de determinados valores em torno de processos educativos, tidos como valores

[*] PhD in Social History at PPGHI/UFU. Collaborating researcher at the Vice-Presidência de Ambiente, Atenção e Promoção da Saúde (VPAAPS), Fundação Oswaldo Cruz – Fiocruz and researcher at the Post-doctoral Program of the Sociology Department of FFLCH/USP. E-mail: denisends@me.com.

[**] PhD in History at PUC/SP, professor at Universidade Federal de Uberlândia, sergio.paulo@ufu.br.

morais e formas de conduta sociais, permitindo evidenciar o entrelaçamento entre práticas socioassistenciais e disciplinarização da pobreza.
Palavras-chave: Programa Bolsa Família. Programa Auxílio Brasil. Pobreza. Trabalho. Uberlândia (MG).

Abstract

This article analyzes the historical process of conciliation between the notions of work and poverty, expressed in social programs of conditional cash transfer. From a bibliographic review that deal with the organization and distribution of social benefits, in addition to presenting local press sources and an interview from a preview research, we highlight how aspects of moralization around the ways of life of impoverished workers acquire greater relevance than supposedly technical or neutral principles for the formulation of such programs. The objective is to understand and explain how the relations between the State and entities, NGOs and service providers operating at the local level throughout the 1990s and early 2000s, when incorporated as "providers of social services" have taken on an institutional role as key players in the Brazilian social protection network. We approach this process in Uberlândia (MG) in dialogue with the national context, which allowed us to observe how these dynamics contributed to the maintenance of certain values around educational processes, considered as moral values and forms of social conduct, making it possible to highlight the interweaving between social assistance practices and the discipline of poverty.
Keywords: Bolsa Família Program. Auxílio Brasil Program. Impoverishment. Work. Uberlândia (MG).

Introduction

In this article, we analyze the social conceptions and moral values that legitimized conditional income transfer programs. Such concepts were interpreted as parameters that guide policies and social programs to combat poverty and hunger in Brazil. We have defined the relationship between the State and civil society, often antagonistic, as a category of analysis. This process tensions conceptions and values related to the pairs autonomy/individual, citizenship/collectivity and disciplinarization/moralization, in the process of managing the pace of poverty reproduction expressed in social programs and policies between the 1990s and 2000s.

We argue that these values determine the format of social programs and their technical aspects, in a process that reverses the truism that a supposedly neutral technology is imposed for the implementation of programs that allow access to Social Rights. Conceptions of poverty are interlinked

with interpretations of the lifestyles of impoverished workers, merit and citizenship. These conceptions correspond to a historical and social process that resignifies how poverty is managed, produced, and reproduced. It hinders the minorization of Brazilian social issues by shaping the policy of these programs, which have become necessary elements for the political stability of governments, whether in the field of the progressive left, the right and, more recently, the ultra-right. Such process becomes possible both regionally and nationally. It hinders the minorization of Brazilian social issues by shaping the policy of these programs, which have become necessary elements for the political stability of governments, whether in the field of the progressive left, the right and, more recently, the ultra-right.

In the first section of this article, we observe the establishment of antagonistic relationships that aimed to reconcile solutions for social programs between 1990 and 2003. Then, we discuss the characterization of conditionalities, relating them to the reading key of the *corpus* of values added to social programs in the period. In other words, we analyze the institutional formulation of certain values and expectations of the families assisted by the State. To analyze the effects of these values, we map and characterize the presence of the concept of citizenship related to the moralizing aspects of the *Bolsa Família Program* (BFP) and the *Auxílio Brasil Program* (ABP), detailing them and their different political contexts.

In the second section, we map the values that shape Brazilian minimum income social programs, with a focus on the articulation of social actions by philanthropic entities for the social assistance field. This analysis was carried out from a regional and national comparative perspective, throughout the 1990s and early 2000s. In the section we examine the antagonistic relations between impoverished workers and social assistance in the city of Uberlândia, Minas Gerais (BR), due to its close relationship with the national scenario in the formulation of social programs.[2]

We conclude with a review of some of the most important points covered and indicate persistent dimensions in the implementation of mechanisms for access to Social Rights, as well as some challenges for rethinking citizenship issues in the coming years.

---

[2] DE SORDI, Denise. *Reformas nos Programas Sociais brasileiros*: Solidariedade, Pobreza e Controle Social (1990-2014). Doctoral Dissertation História Social. Universidade Federal de Uberlândia (UFU). 2019. e; MORAIS, S. P. *Empobrecimento e "inclusão social"* - vida urbana e pobreza na cidade de Uberlândia/MG (1980-2004). Tese de doutorado. História. Pontifícia Universidade Católica de São Paulo (PUC-SP). 2007.

Citizenship, work and self-responsibility

Brazilian social programs were socially re-signified and legitimized in the political and social context of the 1990s and the 2000s. The period is characterized by the implementation of neoliberal policies and the emergence of disputes between political projects for social and economic development, in light of the list of Social Rights materialized in the 1988 Brazilian Constitution. Amid a tense scenario of macroeconomic reforms and popular unrest, political forms and socially acceptable values were defined for the implementation of social policies and conditional income transfer programs.

During this period, the term citizenship has received new and different meanings, such as the ability to act philanthropically[3] and to evoke "individual conscience"[4]. An example of this are the Citizens' Action Campaign Against Poverty and for Life actions in 1992, which urged civil society to "exercise citizenship" by collecting and distributing basic food baskets. One of the highlights of the initiative was the inclusion "only of groups already included[5]. Another example is the perspective of the National Food Nutritional Security Council, CONSEA[6], shortly before its extinction in 1994. In this vision, collective citizenship construction would occur through a "broad and intense popular debate" on the development model, which should prioritize food security and "concrete measures in the various fields of the social structure, from education to health, from housing to transportation, and, above all, full employment [...]."[7] Furthermore, the Solidarity Community Program (SCP), which replaced CONSEA, curtailed the possibilities for citizen participation - both collective and organic - previously under discussion. SCP was operating on the margins of the Organic Law on Social Assistance (OLSA) and beyond the dimension of universalization and promotion of social policies by the state.

---

[3] V. ROCHA, Sonia. *Transferências de Renda*: o fim da pobreza. Rio de Janeiro: Elsevier, 2013. p.80

[4] GOHN, Maria da Glória. A Ação da Cidadania Contra a Miséria e Pela Vida – Ou quando a fome se transforma em questão nacional. In: *Formas de Combate e Resistência à Pobreza*. Luiz Inácio Gaiger (org.). São Leopoldo: Ed. Unisinos, 1996. p.54.

[5] PINTO, Céli Regina Jardim. A sociedade civil e a luta contra a fome no Brasil. *Sociedade e Estado*, Brasília, jan./abr. 2005, v. 20, p. 222.

[6] CONSEA was renamed the National Food and Nutrition Security Council in 2003. The Council was extinguished in Cardoso's first term to make way for the Solidarity Community Program (PCS), was recreated in 2003, in the first year of the Lula administration, and extinguished at the federal level at the national level in 2019 by Jair Bolsonaro, generating a ripple effect for its regional arms, and finally reactivated in 2023 by Lula.

[7] RUIZ, Antonio Ibanez. A gente não quer só comida. Folha de S. Paulo, pp. 1-3, 14 abril 1994 *apud* TELLES, Vera da S. *Pobreza e Cidadania*. São Paulo: Programa de Pós-Graduação em Sociologia da FFLCH-USP/Editora 34, 2013. pp. 154-155.

SCP focused on specific aspects such as hunger and illiteracy, encompassing social issues in the context of "poverty".[8]

From the accumulation of experiences in the 90s, the shift between the meanings of citizenship and the possibilities of guaranteeing universal Social Rights mixed forms of assistance and the action and organization of civil society, through partnerships focused on the third sector. This practice derives from the experience of the Citizenship Action Campaign, which reinforced the presence of NGOs in the mobilization against hunger through decentralized actions, changing the "models of social action"[9] that followed. In turn, in places where the SCP was articulated without organized social movements, "the new social partnership programs" were implemented "as 'social services', that   is, not as rights, but as the provision of services, totally depoliticizing the programs, detaching them from any political content." In such a dynamic, citizenship is framed outside "its collective terms to the old levels of individual citizenship".[10]

The concept of citizenship as an individual issue, centered on the problems faced by certain individuals, has changed the possibilities for collective organization. The proposal to act locally, in so- called less developed regions, providing "help" and attentive "listening" by the SCP, reorganized the logic of citizenship as a catalyst for political action and the democratization of the state.[11]

Hunger, poverty and illiteracy as collective and political responsibilities were transposed to the field of individual action. Thus, the fact that "citizens can only demand their rights to health, education and food from the state"[12] was glossed over. The notion of integration between those included and those excluded from society deepens this process of displacement and establishes that it is precisely through absence that subjects will be integrated. As Gohn

---

[8] REZENDE, Fernando (org.). *Ana Peliano*: uma batalha incansável contra a fome, a pobreza e a desigualdade social. Brasília, IPEA: 2022. p.30

[9] GOHN, Maria da Glória. A Ação da Cidadania Contra a Miséria e Pela Vida – Ou quando a fome se transforma em questão nacional. In: *Formas de Combate e Resistência à Pobreza*. Luiz Inácio Gaiger (org.). São Leopoldo: Ed. Unisinos, 1996. p.23.

[10] GOHN, Maria da Glória. *Teorias dos Movimentos Sociais* – Paradigmas clássicos e contemporâneos. São Paulo: Edições Loyola, 1997. p. 316.

[11] V. DE SORDI, Denise. Reformas nos Programas Sociais brasileiros: Solidariedade, Pobreza e Controle Social (1990-2014). Tese de doutoramento. História Social. Universidade Federal de Uberlândia (UFU). 2019, p. 62.

[12] PINTO, Céli Regina Jardim. A sociedade civil e a luta contra a fome no Brasil. *Sociedade e Estado*, Brasília, jan./abr. 2005, v. 20, p.199.

argues, this is the propagation of a type of economic development that "legitimizes exclusion as a form of integration".[13]

From this sense of citizenship, in the mid-1990s, conflicts between the guarantee of universal access to Social Rights and the use of focalization unfolded to the detriment of universalization as a way of fulfilling the 1988 social pact. According to Soares[14], the concept of universalization presupposes the simultaneity between productive transformation and social justice and was "disqualified as 'utopian' or 'unrealizable', so that the principle of universality was subordinated to economic 'restrictions'". Focalization creates "a differentiated system for meeting individual needs according to purchasing power".

Localized experiments have been conducted in combating poverty through minimum income programs like the *Bolsa Escola* Program. These experiments are based on the shift in the definition of citizenship, although they have been conducted in a laboratory way.[15] Even so, with the non-universalization of social services, the idea of a basic income was presented as a counterpoint to the minimum income. This proposal required no counterpart from beneficiaries and aimed to promote access to a decentralized right outside of family nuclei.[16]

The synthesis of the debates around these proposals took place in the early 1990s, when the then president Fernando Henrique Cardoso (Brazilian Social Democracy Party/ *Partido da Social Democracia Brasileira*-PSDB) declared that the idea of a "citizenship" basic income, then floated by Eduardo Suplicy (Workers' Party/ *Partido dos Trabalhadores*-PT), a senator at the time, would be a "realistic utopia"[17]. However, the focus on the family combined with access to education was the focus of public debate, driven by the press, with the opinion article by economist José Márcio Camargo.[18]

[13] GOHN, Maria da Glória. *Teorias dos Movimentos Sociais* – Paradigmas clássicos e contemporâneos. São Paulo: Edições Loyola, 1997. p. 297.

[14] SOARES, Laura Tavares. Focalização versus Universalização. In: *Enciclopédia Latino Americana*. São Paulo: Boitempo. Retrieved from: http://latinoamericana.wiki.br/verbetes/f/focalizacao-versus-universaliza-cao>. Access: May 24th, 2023.

[15] DE SORDI, Denise. Reformas nos Programas Sociais brasileiros: solidariedade, pobreza e controle social. *Revista Tempos históricos*, v.25, p.70-106, 2021.

[16] SUPLICY, Eduardo Matarazzo. *Renda de Cidadania*: a saída é pela porta. São Paulo: Cortez: Fundação Perseu Abramo, 2002. p. 122.

[17] Idem, p. 122-124.

[18] CAMARGO, José Márcio. Pobreza e Garantia de Renda Mínima. Opinião Econômica. Dinheiro. *Folha de S. Paulo*, 26 dez. de 1991. Acervo Folha Retrieved from:: < http://acervo.folha.uol.com.br/

In his analysis of the characteristics of the production of poverty in the country, Camargo proposed that the *Bolsa Escola* Program should be restricted to workers with a formal contract, so as not to encourage informality. Furthermore, it considered a non-individualized income supplement for the workers' children, on the condition that they were in school.

The clash between the minimum income and the basic income resulted, to a greater or lesser extent, in defining the contours of the characteristics that remained in the social conditional income transfer programs for the following years. Despite public discussions about the structural issues of poverty reproduction, the focus remained on families and access to basic services. This was anchored in a "market logic", such as the defense of the *Bolsa Escola* Program made by Cristóvam Buarque.[19]

Linking the transfer of funds to charitable activity was a way of establishing visibility and social control around beneficiary families, consistent with the political and economic agenda of multilateral organizations. This was considered politically "innovative"[20]compared to the universal basic income proposal, which, despite abandoning conditionalities, also mediated the liberal perspective of non-universal access to Social Rights.

In this way, the conditional transfer is an example of the encounter between the idea of economic development and individualism. This process, known as the "human capital development approach", is characteristic of the process of reconducting social policies "in the direction of poverty alleviation, in an attempt to respond to the processes of generalized precariousness in the lives of the majority of the world's population", but "without altering the contemporary dynamics of wealth accumulation".[21]

The political choice for a minimum income demands the establishment of income cut-off ranges to define a target public so that it is possible to mitigate the effects of low material living conditions. Therefore, it is necessary

---

resultados/?q=josé+márcio+camargo+&site=fsp&periodo=acervo&x=13& y=13>. Access: September 29th, 2017.

[19] The Program, its premises, forms of inspection that involved observations of personal items in the homes of the beneficiaries, developments, changes and permanence, as well as its impact on Brazilian social programs were widely debated in the article DE SORDI, Denise; GONÇALVES NETO, W. A Educação nos Programas Sociais brasileiros: Pobreza e Trabalho. *Educação & Realidade*, v. 46, n. 3, p. 1-22, 2021

[20] SILVA, Maria Ozanira da Silva e. *A política social brasileira no século XXI*: a prevalência dos programas de transferência de renda. São Paulo: Cortez, 2014. p. 60.

[21] MAURIEL, Ana Paula Ornellas. *Combate à pobreza e desenvolvimento humano*: impasses teóricos na construção da política social na atualidade. Doctoral Dissertation. Programa de Pós-Graduação em Ciências Sociais. Unicamp: 2008. p. 139 e 140.

not only for the target audience to be selected based on objective criteria, but also that forms of social inspection are undertaken. As Silva, Yazbek and di Giovanni point out, "the focus on extreme poverty [is done] so that there is no disincentive to work", promoting the "reproduction of a class of poor people, as a guarantee of survival on the threshold of a certain Line of Poverty".[22]

In 2001, the nationalization of the *Bolsa Escola* Program by Fernando Henrique Cardoso, along with the distribution of "vouchers"[23] for the purchase of basic items, supplanted the possibilities of a basic income and the discussions around universalization. The nationalization of governmental social programs,[24] the issuance of magnetic cards the transfer of money by the government, and the creation of the Single Registry (CadÚnico in its Portuguese acronym) for federal government programs in 2001, established the technical core of the social programs that would be developed in the Workers' Party (PT) governments from 2003 onwards.

The perspective of social mobility made it possible to link access to formal education and access to income. This period saw the thematization of social life, i.e. the break, or detachment, of issues that structure life in society and aspects of work. Furthermore, social programs have come to be governed by certain moral perceptions of the impoverished population's way of life.

The proposal to establish an action and/or counterpart for the beneficiaries of social programs for each social vulnerability[25] constituted these perceptions in the cultural field as social mechanisms for access to rights and forms of sociability. Moreover, it operationalized the organization of social places for the poor that would then be mediated by institutionalized and moral mechanisms of surveillance within population groups. From these places, defined by such rules, playing the game of social policies and their values defined by conditionalities or counterparts implied reformulating the principles of citizenship and, therefore, the ways of seeing and identifying oneself as a citizen.

---

[22] SILVA, Maria Ozanira da Silva e. *A política social brasileira no século XXI*: a prevalência dos programas de transferência de renda. São Paulo: Cortez, 2014. p.45.

[23] ROCHA, Sonia. *Transferências de Renda*: o fim da pobreza. Rio de Janeiro: Elsevier, 2013.

[24] DRAIBE, Sônia. A política social no período FHC e o sistema de proteção social. *Tempo Social*, USP, São Paulo, 2003, v. 15, n. 2, pp. 63-101.

[25] According to seção 2.4 "Condicionalidades: a experiência social na medida das vulnerabilidades", cap. 2 em DE SORDI, Denise. *Reformas nos Programas Sociais brasileiros*: Solidariedade, Pobreza e Controle Social (1990-2014). Tese de doutoramento. História Social. Universidade Federal de Uberlândia (UFU). 2019.

As Telles observes about the meanings of destitution, the behavior expected of the poor becomes something situated on a threshold of transformed mediations between deference and social assistance: in an almost lapidary formula, the poor are those who have to prove themselves all the time, make themselves and society see and recognize their own respectability in a world in which insufficient wages, precarious housing, underemployment and periodic unemployment undermine their conditions of possibility. In this case, it would be possible to say that the condition of poverty translates into the experience of a real or virtual liminality between order and disorder, an experience that takes place within the fragile boundaries that separate the "honest worker" from the "poor", who experiences disorder. morality as fado, and the "marginal", which makes this disorder a strategy and a lifestyle.[26]

The connection between individualism, compensation through income transfer and supervision is expressed, although not only, in the change in behavior of the "poor". To have access to any right, they need to, at least symbolically, interpret and incorporate the expectation of focusing that acts, by formal principle, to optimize resources and returns. [27]

In the absence of links to formal jobs as a way of accessing Social Rights, focalization depends on the implementation of moral measures to identify and monitor impoverished workers. This measure has a relational aspect, as it influences the social acceptance of this type of compensatory welfare policy: those who do notn't benefit can evaluate the good use of the resources intended for those in need. In this context, structural issues are understood as individual limitations. Therefore, it is only possible to act in specific cases and groups and these must "appear" to be truly worthy, as Telles argued: they need to prove themselves all the time.

Between 2003 and 2021, the *Bolsa Família* Program (BFP),[28] linked the components of access to education and health to an idea of citizenship. This was linked to reasons and solutions for the condition of poverty of

---

[26] TELLES, V. da S. *Pobreza e Cidadania* / Vera da Silva Telles. São Paulo: Programa de Pós-Graduação em Sociologia da FFLCH-USP/Editora 34, 2013. p. 82.

[27] MARINS, Mani Tebet. Repertórios individuais e estratégias individuais de beneficiários do Bolsa Família. *Sociologia & Antropologia*, out. 2014, Rio de Janeiro, v. 4, n. 2, pp. 557-558.

[28] The BFP was created in 2003 by Provisional Measure (MP) 132, converted into Law 10.836/2004 and regulated by Decree 5.209/2004, synthesizing a significant part of the experiences and debates that make up Brazil's history of formulating social programs and policies to combat hunger and poverty. The milestones for these were the discussions immediately following the country's re-democratization to regulate access to the social rights enshrined in the 1988 Federal Constitution, which were developed throughout the 1990s and early 2000s.

the individuals served, which reverberated in the public discussion about the behavior of impoverished workers throughout the 1990s. The program established conditionalities in reference to the requirement for compensation from beneficiaries.

In 2003, during his speech launching the BFP, President Luiz Inácio Lula da Silva (Workers' Party, PT) announced that the program would be a bridge, or pathway, to give "to give a man a fish while teaching how to fish it".[29] This metaphor expresses the synthesis of the government's philosophy in the sense that "social policy" would create "conditions for the individual [to overcome] the condition of poverty". In this context, in the early 2000s when the first cycle of PT governments led a conciliatory process that provided social cohesion, citizenship was reconceptualized based on Social Rights as the basis for civil and political rights in a conditional model: "Everyone – even though they have the right – wants to give back in some way for the benefits they receive."[30]

At the end of 2013, Sales mapped fifty-five bills that suggested changes to the BFP. A significant part of the projects proposed changes to the program's conditionalities, including demands for "proof of dengue fever prevention, minimum school performance, preventive gynecological exams, identity documents for children over six years old, enrollment of illiterate people aged fifteen to fifty. years for young people and adults".[31] One of these projects was the proposal to participate in comprehensive early childhood development programs, volunteer service, family planning and the inclusion of an obligation for parents or guardians to attend school meetings. Such projects were proposed by both the progressive political camp in the government as well as the opposition.

The justifications for new conditionalities are generally based on the idea of "strengthening citizenship among the poorest sections of the population", "increasing opportunities for social mobility and affirming citizenship", as well as "exercising basic citizenship rights and opportunities

---

[29] BRASIL. Biblioteca da Presidência da República. Presidência da República. Secretaria de Imprensa e Divulgação. *Discurso do Presidente da República. Pronunciamento do Presidente da República*, Luiz Inácio Lula da Silva, na cerimônia de lançamento do Programa Bolsa Família, de transferência de renda. Palácio do Planalto, 20 de outubro de 2003. p. 5. Retrieved from:< http://www.biblioteca.presidencia.gov.br/presidencia/ex-presidentes/luiz-inacio-lula-da- silva/discursos/1o-mandato/2003/20-10-2003-discur-so-do-pr-luiz-inacio-lula-da-silva-na-cerimonia-de- lancamento-do-programa-bolsa-familia.pdf/view>. Access April 24th, 2018.

[30] Ibidem.

[31] SALES, Tainah Simões. *O Estado, a pobreza e o Programa Bolsa Família*. Curitiba: Editora Prismas, 2015. p. 265.

for social mobility"[32]. At this point, we highlight not the worth of these projects, but the use of the term "citizenship" to mobilize the accomplishment of tasks that impoverished worked supposedly could not fulfill. This evidences the disarticulation between citizenship as a collective exercise and the promotion of access to Social Rights through their expansion. We note that one of the most recurrent arguments about the idea of the program as a disincentive to employment is the need for birth control among families benefiting from the BFP. Supposedly, erroneously,[33] families would have more children in order to receive more benefits. However, prior to the nationalization of social programs and the implementation of the BFP, there was already public discussion[34] questioning actions such as the Citizenship Action Campaign by sociologist Herbert de Souza. They associated not only the idea of large poor families to the increase in poverty and violence, but also discussed the historical process that constituted the place of poor children in Brazilian society, closely linked to Malthusian discourses and a certain form of social Darwinism[35]. Sposati notes that, in Brazil, the limitation on the number of children to be covered by the benefits transferred to families refers to the "concern not to stimulate fertility [which] was strongly introduced by Family Welfare in Brazil (Benfam) during the dictatorial period"[36].

Instead of expanding social services, the actions aimed at beneficiaries of social programs focus fall, with such proposals, into the realm of individual actions and containment of public security. An example is the "Criminal Clean Record" proposal, which signaled the possibility of requiring beneficiary families to have a "clean criminal record", with the aim of preventing

---

[32] The passages are, respectively, in the justifications of the projects PL 44/2007; PL 1839/2007,; PL 6312/2009, todos arquivados em 2022.

[33] There are countless studies that show that the PBF has not led to an increase in the number of children and that indicate that the fall in the fertility rate is a national trend. An example of a very comprehensive study presenting data from 1991 onwards is the text by ALVES, José Eustáquio Diniz. CAVENAGHI, Suzana. O Programa Bolsa Família e as Taxas de Fecundidade no Brasil. In: *Programa Bolsa Família*: uma década de inclusão e cidadania. Tereza Campello, Marcelo Côrtes Neri (org.). Brasília: Ipea, 2013. pp. 233 – 245.

[34] Memória Roda Viva. Roda Viva. Fundação Padre Anchieta ; Labjor; Nepp. *Herbert de Souza*. 6 jan. 1992. p.4 e p. 8. Retrieved from: < http://www.rodaviva.fapesp.br/materia/494/entrevistados/herbert_de_souza_betinho_1992.htm>. Access: 16 aug. 2017.

[35] FENELON, Déa. Resenha do livro História Social da Criança Abandonada. Anos 90, Porto Alegre, jul. de 1999, n.11, pp. 186-193; V. DE SORDI, Denise. *Reformas nos Programas Sociais brasileiros*: Solidariedade, Pobreza e Controle Social (1990-2014). Tese de doutoramento. História Social. Universidade Federal de Uberlândia (UFU). 2019, p. 47.

[36] SPOSATI, Aldaíza. Bolsa Família: Um programa com futuro(s). In: *Bolsa Família 2003-2010*: avanços e desafios (v. 2). Jorge Abrahão de Castro, Lúcia Modesto (org.). Brasília: Ipea, 2010. p. 284.

"the transfer of income from stimulating activities harmful to security"[37]. Citizenship then becomes a significant term for actions that would model certain individual behaviors, from the perspective of improving life, intuiting that structural issues correspond to conditions experienced by individuals.

As Justo points out[38], the system of operationalization of policies can be considered secondary, since the "core of beliefs and values is what does not change, precisely because it is this that is the target of the political dispute". The conditional distribution of income means that beneficiaries are expected to do something for themselves once they receive the benefit, which changes the parameters of social solidarity These become an individual stimulus, even in adverse political, economic and social circumstances[39].

Between 2003 and 2021, the BFP was considered one of the largest minimum income programs in Latin America. It focused on the direct transfer of money to the families served and on mediating access to health and education services, based on a structuring premise of intergenerational poverty reduction. This set of actions overshadowed the political possibilities of the *Fome Zero* Program, still in 2003, which aimed to deal with structural issues of poverty.

The article does not analyze the consequences of Jair Bolsonaro's government (Liberal Party/ *Partido Liberal*- PL), whose economic and political measures caused the disruption of this cycle of social policies and programs from 2019 and 2022[40]. However, we highlight that in 2021 the BFP

---

[37] BRASIL, Emanuelle. Edição de Marcelo Oliveira. Ficha limpa criminal poderá ser exigida para receber Bolsa Família. *Agência Câmara Notícias*. Assistência Social. 19 jan. 2015. Retrieved from: <http://www2.camara.leg.br/camaranoticias/noticias/ASSISTENCIA-SOCIAL/480518-FICHA-LIMPA- CRIMINAL-PODERA-SER-EXIGIDA-PARA-RECEBER-BOLSA-FAMILIA.html>. Access: February 22nd, 2015. O projeto foi arquivado em 2019.

[38] JUSTO, Carolina Raquel Duarte de Mello. *Política de Transferência de Renda e Cidadania no Brasil*: Implicações Político-Sociais dos Programas Municipais de Renda Mínima a partir do Estudo Comparativo dos casos de Campinas, Jundiaí, Santo André e Santos (1995-2006). Tese de doutorado UNICAMP, Campinas, SP, 2007. p. 15.

[39] This issue is extensively discussed in Chap. 2 in DE SORDI, Denise. *Reformas nos Programas Sociais brasileiros*: Solidariedade, Pobreza e Controle Social (1990-2014). Tese de doutoramento. História Social. Universidade Federal de Uberlândia (UFU). 2019.

[40] Considerations about the Covid-19 pandemic and its relationship with Emergency Aid are not the subject of this article. They are analyzed and debated in DE SORDI, D. Empobrecimento, fome e pandemia: o Auxílio Emergencial, o fim do Programa Bolsa Família e o Auxílio Brasil, 2019-2022. *História, Ciências, Saúde – Manguinhos*. v.30, p. 1-20, 2023. Likewise, the process of abolishing the PBF and implementing the PAB, amid the policy of dismantling social programs and policies during the Bolsonaro government, as well as its connection with the labor and social security reforms of Michel Temer's government (Brazilian Democratic Movement, MDB) is already widely debated and recorded in the article DE SORDI, D. Programas Sociais brasileiros e a desativação da esfera pública. *Locus Revista de história*. v. 29, n. 1, p. 203-221, 2023.

was extinguished in 2021. The measure was later regulated by Law 14.284[41], which established the *Auxílio Brasil* Program (ABP). It provided mechanisms and instruments centered on the notion of "financial education" and "citizen emancipation" for the management of poverty by the individuals assisted. However, at the time in question, nearly half of the population was in the informal job market and 14,7% of the people were unemployed. Furthermore, 72.4% of workers received wages that were insufficient to pay basic bills[42].

With the ABP, social assistance was shifted from the family nucleus, previously privileged by the BFP, to the notion of the individual. This measure was anchored in the epistemology of a certain Brazilian-style liberalism[43], proclaimed in the objectives of the then new program of "*stimulating individual effort*" and "rural and urban productive inclusion, with a view to *citizen emancipation*"[44]. There has certainly been change in the concept previously legitimized by the BFP, which guaranteed minimum circuits of access to social assistance services as a form of access to rights in education and health. It is also true that the BFP and the ABP cannot be compared[45]. However, it is crucial to recognize the permanence of values and moral conceptions that influence proposals and changes in programs that demarcate care for subjects considered "poor" by technical criteria detached from social and economic readings of poverty. This relates to moral aspects that support the idea not only of self-responsibility for poverty, but that, with the right individual motivation, it would be possible to "get out" of this condition, which would be the same as withdrawing from the structuring conditions of Brazilian society.

The change in the ABP occurred due to the infiltration of the gaps in moral and social values present in the BFP. They reflected - and still reflect - the gap in the failure to tackle the issues that produce social inequality. These issues were expanded so that dimensions of the need for moralization and

---

Some of these discussions are still recorded in articles published in the press by the author. For the impact of some of the changes considered 'technical' in this period and their effect on the subjects served by the programs according to LACERDA, Paula. Estado, gênero e Covid-19: Trânsito de mulheres por setores da administração pública em tempos de pandemia. *Mana*, 2022, v. 1, n. 28, pp.1-33.

[41] BRASIL. *Lei n° 14.284*, de 29 de dezembro de 2021. Retrieved from: https://www.planalto.gov.br/ccivil_03/_ato2019-2022/2021/lei/l14284.htm. Access: May 20th, 2023.

[42] https://agenciadenoticias.ibge.gov.br/agencia-noticias/2012-agencia-de-noticias/noticias/31401-72-4-dos-brasileiros-vivem-em-familias-com-dificuldades-para-pagar-as-contas

[43] SCHWARZ, Roberto. *As ideias fora do lugar:* ensaios selecionados. São Paulo: Penguin Classics Companhia das Letras, 2014.

[44] BRASIL. MP n° 1061, de 9 de agosto de 2021. Retrieved from: https://www.planalto.gov.br/ccivil_03/_ato2019-2022/2021/Mpv/mpv1061.htm. Access May 24th, 2023. our highlight)

[45] This discussion has been extensively covered in works already referenced in the notes to this article.

disciplining of the workers served by the ABP could occur, aligned with the ideology of a government with an ultra-right-wing political program. In the meantime, the ABP institutionalized the blaming of impoverished workers. The action was detached from the context of Brazil's economic, social and health crisis, by reading low material living conditions as the absence of "individual effort" for some kind of "productive insertion".

However, the existence of the ABP indicated something that had already emerged in previous research: conditional cash transfer programs were important because they served significant portions of the population, boosting the process of social cohesion and political conciliation guided by values and moral conceptions that corresponded to readings of society that were particularized at the local level. To understand this process of legitimization, we look at the 1990s in the following section.

Disciplinarization and internalization of habits and values

The development of social programs locally in relation to national proposals, requires the establishment of certain social and political cohesion. This ensures these projects are supported by those who are to be assisted and those who are not. The observation of localized social programs indicates that the idea of citizenship and social disciplinarization is one of the main ways of legitimizing socially and culturally the norms and behaviors considered acceptable in the context of social programs to combat poverty and hunger. The city of Uberlândia, in Minas Gerais, Brazil, presents a significant case study for observing how national programs are read and adapted locally during the 1990s and 2000s. Throughout the 1990s, the Citizenship Action Campaign involved a wide range of subjects and philanthropic organizations in the city, as well as initiatives distributing beans from the stocks of the National Supply Company (Conab), and the formulation of food distribution programs, such as Pró-pão[46]. All these actions informed patterns, experiences and conceptions about the impoverished population and the limits and ways of incorporating previous actions when they were incorporated into the *Bolsa Escola* Program, from 2001, and the BFP, from 2003.

At the beginning of the Citizenship Action Campaign in the city, *Correio de Uberlândia* (a local newspaper that stopped circulating in 2019) recorded that "the 800 employees of BB [Banco do Brasil] branches and stations in the

---

[46] Pró-pão was legally instituted in 1995, as reported by Morais, who discussed it in depth. It is a program that subsidizes the purchase of basic food baskets for needy families living in Uberlândia by up to 20%.

city are donating meal tickets, which end up becoming a basic food basket for donations to needy families". The coordination was dispersed between *Central Única dos Trabalhadores* (CUT), Banco do Brasil, Caixa Econômica Federal and teachers. The Federal University of Uberlândia, (UFU) articulated the efforts "so that ideas can become practical, as soon as possible"[47].

The banks involved also "adopted favelas", and the campaign was organized to ensure food distribution feasibility. Among the actions developed, the organizing Committee found itself "stuck" with "small problems", even though its members had to "think about broader actions aimed at rescuing citizenship". The Committee realized that the sale of electoral ballots collected as recyclable material by the Campaign — corresponding to "500 kilos (...) donated by the three electoral zones of the city", — at first considered valuable, "was worth very little to the buyers". According to the Committee's balance sheet, "the highest price we've received so far is CR$4.00 a kilo, which would be CR$2,000, not enough money to put together a good basic food basket"[48].

> In 1994, the newspaper *Correio de Uberlândia* published preliminary research data from the Center for Documentation and Socio-Economic Research (CEPES), at UFU. According to the article, "Misery affects 10% of the population", and "45% of the residents of 27 peripheral neighborhoods in the city live in absolute misery". In addition, "of the total number of miserable people, 80% are from Uberlândia" and the other 20% would be from other regions of Minas Gerais, with a small portion of 3% from other states. As Morais pointed out at the time:

The coordinator of the local "Citizenship Action" was irritated when he realized that the residents of the poorest neighborhoods, interviewed by the economists responsible for the survey, said that the main problems in those areas stemmed from the lack of policing, asphalt, public squares and sports centers for leisure. (...) At the time, I said that 'they haven't managed to measure the bigger problem of hunger (...) and they don't even mention it'.

Instead of fulfilling the expectations of the local coordinator of Citizenship Action Campaign, the survey failed to measure hunger as the "biggest problem". The residents declared their main demands to the researchers, who evaluated the claims according to the percentage of

---

[47] Excerpts quoted from: *Correio*. Miséria se alastra pelo nariz de Minas. Cidades, p. 9. 4 julho de 1993. n° 16.291. ArPU Correio n° 173.

[48] Excerpts quoted from: Correio. Comitê agiliza sistema de distribuição de alimentos. set. 1993. n° 16.348. ArPU Correio do Triângulo n° 175.

responses in the universe of neighborhoods surveyed. The demands referred to the need for sewage, running water, public transport, asphalting, school daycare, public telephone, policing, health center", among others linked to the infrastructure of basic services and leisure[49].

Previously portrayed as places in the process of favelization, and home to workers subject to the effects of concentration of income, land and low wages, the regions targeted by solidarity actions came to be seen as places of expression of solidarity and resilience of poor and needy families, in the face of stories framed as "misfortune" that were told by residents when approached by the press: "In the past, I was able to help many people. Today it's as if I can't believe we're in this situation."[50]

However, solidarity and resilience are presented as issues that reorganize the political dimension of social life. The construction of this political dimension created a concept of identity for the poor centered on the actions of organizations and individual actions by organized individuals in Uberlândia. This identity is aligned with the selection criteria for entry into various social programs of the period.

The CEPES/UFU researchers highlight that a significant portion of the population interviewed "categorically" stated that they did not receive "help" from any kind of institution or organization. The relationship of mutual vigilance between public authorities and the "poor" evidences the heterogeneity of poverty as a condition linked to low wages, and at the same time, demands the correct identification donation to the poor who would deserve help. As Joaquim Sebastião pointed out in 1997, when interviewed by Morais:

> Sérgio Paulo: How do you consider yourself... a carter?
> Joaquim Sebastião: I'm a worker... which many people isn't... like that man and woman over there... they ain't have kids... they ain't have anything... they're strong... they ain't work... and every Saturday people come and bring them stuff to eat... right now two cars stopped... didn't you see? They brought baskets and everything...
> Sérgio Paulo: No, I didn't see..
> Joaquim Sebastião: I work... a lot... during the day... and at night too... and no one has ever come here to give me a basket...

---

[49] SHIKI, S.; NEDER, H. D. (Org.); *Condições Sócio-Econômicas das Famílias na Periferia de Uberlândia.* CEPES / UFU. Uberlândia, fevereiro de 1996. pp. 97-101.

[50] MOREIRA, G. Sem-teto lutam diariamente. *Correio.* Cidades, p. A 6. 7 jul. 2003. n° 19.442. ArPU n° 293.

> clothes, shoes for the kids, nothing... I should earn... I have
> children to raise... and everything...[51]
> Joaquim Sebastião identified himself as a worker and made a
> notable difference to those of his neighbors who, according to
> him, did not perform similar work, but who still received help
> from third parties.

Joaquim Sebastião identified himself as a worker and made a notable difference to those of his neighbors who, according to him, did not perform similar work, but who still received help from third parties. He does not identify himself as the target audience for social assistance programs and actions, but identifies those who need help because they are poor, in line with very "imprecise" criteria[52] published locally. He appears to be suspicious of the formal definition of poverty, its criteria and justifications. Distrust regarding the condition of "poverty" was not an element articulated only by ordinary people like Joaquim Sebastião. In 1999, the Municipal Department of Labor and Social Action began issuing "poverty certificates". The purpose of the document was to exempt notary fees for birth or death registrations.

The social grammar of "hunger" and the "poor", unusual in the mid-1990s, resurfaces with the introduction of the BFP and the national projection of the program from 2003 onwards. Such grammar had social and cultural meaning, undermining forms of interpretation about low material living conditions and possibilities for change based on collective organization in neighborhoods and territories considered peripheral.

The organization of social assistance in Uberlândia was alignedin line with national events. However, the interests of local economic development and the organization of solidarity actions and shelters, especially for children mediated this close relationship. A philanthropic tradition guided these actions; a tradition that, to a certain extent, coexisted with the actions of the Citizenship Action Campaign. Its call for "solidarity action" aimed to disassociate "aid" practices that had the balance of supporting local politicians, taking on a non-partisan tone[53]. This left citizens and local public authorities to identify areas with poor and needy people.

---

[51] MORAIS, S. P. *Incluídos?* pobreza e políticas compensatórias em um Brasil rico. Saarbrücken: Editorial Academica Española, 2012. pp. 7-8

[52] Ibidem, p. 91

[53] GOHN, Maria da Glória. A Ação da Cidadania Contra a Miséria e Pela Vida – Ou quando a fome se transforma em questão nacional. In: *Formas de Combate e Resistência à Pobreza.* Luiz Inácio Gaiger (org.). São Leopoldo: Ed. Unisinos, 1996. p. 31.

The Campaign aimed to produce "social pressure" that would institute new ways of "living together socially" and emphasize that Brazil is "a rich country" that produces "poor people, because it has become the property of a few who are competent at exploiting and corrupting". The actions should "not allow themselves to be instrumentalized" by electoral roles, but focus on their "pedagogical function" of redefining ways of doing politics.[54]

The discourse of non-instrumentalization was adopted in Uberlândia by building up a non-political perception in local government bodies. In practice, it resulted in the insertion of agents into community groups through technical discourse and qualified or even financial support through the distribution of funds. Local political disputes, living parts of the national context, allow us to notice how definitions of poverty and the organization of poor people's lives relate not only to sensations/impressions about social issues, but also to political projects disputed in the midst of the government of the then president Itamar Franco[55]. In the case of social assistance actions, encouraged by the Brazilian federal government, the criteria for food distribution that would select the truly poor and needy people "who 'wanted' to get rid of poverty"[56] were also instituted at the level of local political projects, in an institutionalized, formalized way.

Since the beginning of the 1990s, the organization of neighborhood associations began to suffer from the interference of the municipal government[57]. Consequently, NGOs and associations began to act as pacifying and intermediary elements in the politics of popular demands. Such instances also limited conflicts by mediating the possibilities of negotiation, which often took place through the patronage of city councilors and employers.[58]

At the beginning of the 2000s, actions aimed at the poor began to reproduce the values and impressions related to poverty socially legitimized

---

[54] LARA, Tiago Adão. Ação da Cidadania. *Correio*. Opinião, p. 4. 30 jul. 1993. n° 16.313. ArPU Correio do Triângulo n° 173.

[55] It is worth noting that its work was fundamental in promoting "hunger" as an issue that united the social fabric in the face of the need for political balance required by the process of democratic stabilization, a process in which the installation of CONSEA was essential.

[56] MORAIS, S. P. *Incluídos?* pobreza e políticas compensatórias em um Brasil rico. Saarbrücken: Editorial Academica Española, 2012. p. 105.

[57] JESUS, Wilma Ferreira de. *Poder público e movimentos sociais* – Aproximações e distanciamentos. Uberlândia 1982-2000. Dissertação de Mestrado. Programa de Pós-Graduação em História. Universidade Federal de Uberlândia, 2002.

[58] OLIVEIRA, Romilda Aparecida Cardoso de. *A Construção do Bairro Mansour na Memória dos Moradores* – Uberlândia (1992-2003). Monografia. Instituto de História da Universidade Federal de Uberlândia, 2003.

in the 1990s, in an environment of practices organized by the management logic of national social assistance programs. Mechanisms of social control were instituted in the BFP conditionalities due to their contractual nature, accompanied by the argument of the need to promote a type of social development aimed at the families being assisted. However, such mechanisms were socially significant in the course of the development of acceptable forms for social policies in the 1990s. In the Brazilian context, as a recurring theme of social experience, the uses of the concept of "poverty" have had their meanings traversed by the remodelling of types of solidarity action, formulated by the issues of hunger, citizenship and social inequality. These terms gave materiality to specific social values and functioned as cultural mediators in the negotiation of the forms assumed by different political-economic projects.

By the end of the 1990s, the Statute of the Child and Adolescent (ECA) had imposed different parameters on Ssocial Rrights for the care of children at risk. This interference impacted the way children were treated through a work-based educational ethics that had been in place until then. Organizations related to this issue began to focus on "needy children" in a sense of welcoming them in solidarity, emphasizing in providing food instead of using work as a moralizing occupation that disciplines the use of time. In 1996, such issues permeated the very concept of education because "it was associated with moralizing and corrective elements aimed at removing children from the streets". However, "formal education, on the other hand, although seen through the perspective of preventing begging and delinquency, was seen as a value that urban workers aspired to". This expectation was related to the curricular requirements for getting a job and improving the subjects' living conditions.[59]

As observed by Morais, in his research on the performance and minutes of the Minor Guidance Units (UOMENS) in Uberlândia: "(...) the poor came to be seen as agents of the economic 'crisis'" that was causing the city to lose its stautes as *Eldorado* of Minas Gerais. To the children,

> work [was] instituted in an 'educational' way [and] was characterized as a moralizing instrument, prone to establishing rules that should be reproduced in the social environment. One of the mechanisms for transforming work into rules was through

---

[59] See note nº 366 and p. 200 in: MORAIS, S. P. *Incluídos?* pobreza e políticas compensatórias em um Brasil rico. Saarbrücken: Editorial Academica Española, 2012.

paying the children, a fact not recorded in the newspapers of the period.[60]

It is important to note that the idea of "removing children from the streets" was widely propagated during the 1990s and early 2000s as one of the objectives of local assistance programs. After the nationalization of the *Bolsa Escola* Program (BEP), the idea of training qualified workers was incorporated, with the aim of all students completing primary education. As the Minister of Educations Paulo Renato Souza stated at the launch of the program, the objective was to offer " financial incentive" for the family to enroll and keep their children in school. To bring about a 'social revolution' in the country, the minister defended the permanence and completion of primary education[61]. With the BFP now consolidated as a social and economic development program under Luiz Inácio Lula da Silva's government, access to formal education appears as a form of social mobility and intergenerational break from poverty. Its absence is not associated with the description of living conditions connected to processes of impoverishment and exploitation of labor.

The implementation of such policies demonstrates a long period of affirmation of values considered correct for the poor. These values presuppose internalization as a stance to be taken by the people who benefit from the services offered by social programs. From the BFP onwards, the functions of several entities active in the 1990s became closer because their actions were standardized by municipal management, in the form of service providers.[62]

The launch of the BFP had minimal repercussion in the Correio newspaper. The articles about it in 2004 had an informative tone, and covered topics such as its expansion by the federal government, the re-registration of the *Bolsa Escola* Program and the distribution of BFP cards by Caixa Econômica Federal[63].Despite little repercussion on the organization of the federal government's social program, numerous reports portrayed actions by social entities. These actions concerned activities promoted by various institutions,

---

[60] MORAIS, S. P. *Empobrecimento e "inclusão social"* - vida urbana e pobreza na cidade de Uberlândia/MG (1980-2004). Tese de doutorado. História. Pontifícia Universidade Católica de São Paulo (PUC-SP). 2007. p. 22.

[61] *Correio*. MEC abre inscrições para bolsa-escola. p. A-2. 15 março de 2001. n° 18.674. ArPU Correio n° 265.

[62] VIOLIN, Tarso Cabral. Terceiro Setor e as parcerias com a administração pública: uma análise crítica. Belo Horizonte: Fórum, 2010.

[63] Agência Brasil. Lula quer incluir todas as cidades no Bolsa Família. *Correio*. Política, p. A 3.11 out. 2004. n° 19.904. ArPU n° 308.; MOREIRA, Gustavo. Caixa distribui Bolsa Família amanhã / Bolsa Escola passa por recadastramento. *Correio*. Cidade, p. B 1. 22 out. 2004. n° 19.915. ArPU n° 308.

such as dance, music, film sessions, handicrafts, *Reiki*, community gardens, among others. They would promote occupations that seemed correct and "dignified", and spaces to "teach citizenship"[64].

In December 2012, when the BFP was already consolidated, the *Correio de Uberlândia* newspaper published the article "Needy families receive basic food baskets", which reported the distribution of basic food baskets to needy families in the annual campaign promoted by the Associação Assistencial Vida e Esperança - AVE (Life and Hope Assistance Association), an organization with 20 years of assistance services in Uberlândia. The article also mentioned that "in total, 65 families registered in the association's database receive aid every month". When the baskets were distributed, the beneficiaries took part in activities such as prayers, breakfast, a theatrical play and the distribution of toys for the children[65].

The question that arises is that social programs developed throughout the 1990s initiated a type of institution of rules for the selection of poor people that modified the forms of organization of the social relations constituted between the state, private social assistance entities and portions of the population. The BFP, in turn, reorganized the forms of social relations by normalizing them based on preconceptions surrounding experiences of impoverishment. This reorganization was enabled by its greatest achievements: the number of people assisted and its scope. The program has therefore shifted the condition of poverty to the role of norm rather than transforming it. Social assistance programs began to function through the implicit standardization of moral values in the fields of social experience that determine social relations marked by class antagonism.

Regulations for local and national social assistance programs in the 1990s referred not only to selection criteria for food distribution or performance, but foremost to the standards of conduct expected by workers upon their identification as poor. The establishment of such norms mediated the ways in which the processes of struggles and demands were institutionally absorbed as individual issues: lack of formal education, professional disqualification, large families, neglect of children, inappropriate consumption habits and misuse of money. This is a cultural mechanism that aims to moralize the impoverished workers' living conditions through the idea of being both a

---

[64] Moreira, Gustavo. Vivendo e Aprendendo – Projeto acolhe e ensina cidadania às crianças do Guarani. *Correio*. Cidade, p. B 2. 13 set. 2006. n° 20.241. Ar PU Correio 325.

[65] SOARES. Famílias carentes recebem cestas básicas. *Correio*. Cidade & Região, p. A 4. 25 dez. 2012. n° 22.902. ArPU n° 412.

worker and "poor".This movement indicates the reference to "work" outside the realm of access and guarantee to formal employment, but as a behavior, a category of ways of being and a practice of social registration.

Final considerations

The analysis of the processes addressed here — those of reorganization of programs and social policies to combat poverty and hunger — sought to interrogate and highlight the relationship between work and poverty that had remained, in a certain way, underground, emerging in the public sphere from 2016 onwards. The analysis was carried out by revisiting previous research material in light of the profound political changes that occurred in Brazil between 2016 and 2022. This phenomenon has intensified from 2019 on, with the election of the political and economic project of Jair M. Bolsonaro (PL).

We demonstrate that the process of dissolution of programs that seemed consolidated did not arise from the lack of conflict, but from the opening of a field of action that aligned local institutional particularities of social assistance programs with national programs. Local impressions and dynamics of social relations linked to a kind of opposition to forms of organization of demanding improvements for basic services began to be incorporated into institutional action in a conciliation movement marked by the ambiguity of actions in the social area. The movement socially organized from top to bottom entailed convincing impoverished workers that accepting immediate compensation was the only alternative to the productive relationships in which they were inserted. The movement was an expression of the process of class conciliation

In other words, the precarious conditions of the relations of social reproduction[66] have been redefined as the experiences of poor people, with the processes of exploitation and accumulation - in the abstract, with the help of technique - displaced in the same way as reproduction. The phenomenon of the temporal behavior of poverty serves as a connection with the social set of Brazilian society and has acted in the midst of class conflicts and antagonisms. Poverty is considered a constant social phenomenon and a constituent part of the historical process of inequality in Brazil. However, poverty is more than a descriptive term or an ordering category of politics. It refers to the terms of a lived condition that is related to different conceptions and values that underpin social organization. Meanwhile, the social process of reorganization

---

[66] LINEBAUGH, Peter. Ypsilanti – Vampiros rondam o dia do trabalho. *Tempos Históricos,* Cascavel, 2018, v. 22, pp. 331-369

of social policies, analyzed here, questions social assistance practices, not for their merit and their techniques for limiting the identification of the poor or their objectives of combating poverty, but as a structuring element of social life, in a conflictual political field that poses opposing poles and interests, changing the relationships between them.

In the Brazilian historical context, as a recurring theme of the social experience of impoverishment, the uses of "poverty" have had their meanings crossed by the remodeling of types of solidarity action, formulated by the issues of hunger, citizenship and social inequality. Such terms gave materiality to specific social values that allowed conquered Social Rights to be offered as individual needs, outlined through the notion of social vulnerabilities. In this sense, the concept of citizenship has also been modeled by the forms of poverty management. Unlike citizenship, whose organization presupposes agency, poverty is a social category that demands to receive organization.

In 2023, amid the presidential election and the tension to defend democracy, the election that returned Luiz Inácio Lula da Silva to the office through the articulation of a broad front, allowed the closure of the ABP and the return of the BFP. This was restructured by Provisional Measure 1,164 in March 2023[67]. The BFP conditionalities were reactivated and the amounts transferred to families increased, providing relief not only to those who defend democracy as an articulating principle of social programs and policies. This also helped families assisted and on the waiting list who suffered an accelerated and brutal process of impoverishment, precarious employment relationships and who experienced the return of widespread hunger in the country between 2019 and 2019.

However, it is clear that the social and cultural issues and dimensions that hampered the implementation of the BFP in the early 2000s remained unresolved due to the cycle of social development expressed in a horizon of expectation for social mobility, characterized by various social policies and programs., including the BFP, were not reviewed.

As part of this process, it is worth highlighting two moments that seem symbolic when seen after the overhaul of social programs between 2019 and 2023. The first depicts the launch of the Food Card by *Fome Zero* Program in 2003 (later incorporated into the BFP[68]):

[67] BRASIL. *Medida Provisória n° 1.164*, de 2 de março de 2023. Retrieved from:< https://www.planalto.gov.br/ccivil_03/_ato2023-2026/2023/mpv/mpv1164.htm>.

[68] For the debate on the Food Card and the reasons for the political shading of the Zero Hunger program

> At the beginning of 2003, surrounded by Ministers and other agents of the Federal Administration, the then governor of Piauí, Wellington Dias, of the Workers' Party [PT], ended his speech at the launch of the Food Card (one of the initial actions in the implementation of the *Fome Zero* Program) by asking around a thousand residents of the town of Acauã to raise their hands and promise to leave poverty behind. Several calloused hands were raised, repeating the phrases of the oath chanted by the governor. Apart from the unusual gesture, what does the occasion tell us? I believe that, regardless of the presence of political leaders, the factor of a crowd on pilgrimage, or praying, is a significant factor in the behavior and culture of workers who, living in a region considered to be poor, challenge the "poverty of the land", the hardships experienced due to the low prospects of food and physical survival. [...] [I draw] attention to some other elements present in this scene: the social location of those who made the promise and those who encouraged them; the idea of food as a response to the situation of poverty; and the concomitant idea of poverty as hunger.[69]

Twenty years later, the second moment took place at an official ceremony at the Planalto Palace, which presented the official reinstallation of the BFP in 2023. Those present, on stage and in the audience, were invited by the new minister Wellington Dias, to stand up and join hands forming a chain. Invoking God's blessings, the Minister speaks: "Finally, I would like us to all stand up, everyone to join hands. First, President, I wanted to thank God [...]". Dias continues with his speech, blessing everyone, the National Congress and thanking the parliamentarians present at the ceremony. He invites everyone, including activists of the black movement and representatives of indigenous peoples, to join in praying the Lord's Prayer as a gesture of gratitude and then evokes a jester:

> I, from today onwards, will join with millions of Brazilian men and women and together, again with President Lula, we will take Brazil off the Hunger Map, we will take Brazil off the food and

---

through the launch of the BFP. DE SORDI, Denise. *Reformas nos Programas Sociais brasileiros*: Solidariedade, Pobreza e Controle Social (1990-2014). Tese de doutoramento. História Social. Universidade Federal de Uberlândia (UFU). 2019.

[69] CONSTANTINO, Luciana. Petista Convoca Juramento Contra Pobreza. *Jornal Folha de São Paulo*. 05/02/2003, p. A 12.

> nutritional insecurity map, hand in hand, Let's join hands with those who need it most and no one lets go of anyone's hand. [70]

Finally, Lula signs the Provisional Measure that recreates the BFP. These two moments, separated by twenty years, indicate the permanence in the institutional body of values, mechanisms and practices that constitute the comings and goings of social programs to combat poverty and hunger in the country. The permanence of a type of conservatism, which sometimes acts as a driver and sometimes is led, is evident throughout the Brazilian New Republic, which directs an important part of the conceptions regarding the production and reproduction of poverty and hunger. Both, before being descriptive terms, are real conditions experienced by impoverished workers, men and women. They are pressured by expectations and modulation in their ways of acting, claiming and registering socially to follow the formal paths of access to Social Rights.

This is not just about the course of a neoliberal project, but how it assumed specificities in the dimension of social policies to combat poverty in the face of national and local political pressures. Generalizations regarding poverty and hunger, supported by technical and scientific evidence, emphasized inequalities in access to Social Rights. This highlights how the universalization of rights has been operationalized and shifted towards a specific type of social return which, in practice, has allowed a large portion of the population to maintain minimum survival needs through conditionalities.

References

Agência Brasil. Lula quer incluir todas as cidades no Bolsa Família. *Correio*. Política, p. A 3.11 out. 2004. n° 19.904. ArPU n° 308.

ALVES, José Eustáquio Diniz. CAVENAGHI, Suzana. O Programa Bolsa Família e as Taxas de Fecundidade no Brasil. In: *Programa Bolsa Família*: uma década de inclusão e cidadania. Tereza Campello, Marcelo Côrtes Neri (org.). Brasília: Ipea, 2013. pp. 233 – 245.

BRASIL, Emanuelle. Edição de Marcelo Oliveira. Ficha limpa criminal poderá ser exigida para receber Bolsa Família. *Agência Câmara Notícias*. Assistência Social. 19 jan. 2015. Disponível em: <http://www2.camara.leg.br/camaranoticias/noticias/

---

[70] BRASIL. *Canal oficial do Ministério do Desenvolvimento Social no YouTube*. Lançamento do Novo Bolsa Família. 02 mar. 2023. Minutos 1:31:33 em diante. Retrieved from: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=G_voq-QYYknY&t=5494s. Access: May 24th, 2023.

ASSISTENCIA-SOCIAL/480518-FICHA-LIMPA- CRIMINAL-PODERA-SER-EXIGIDA-PARA-RECEBER-BOLSA-FAMILIA.html>. Acesso em: 22 fev. 2015. O projeto foi arquivado em 2019.

BRASIL. Biblioteca da Presidência da República. Presidência da República. Secretaria de Imprensa e Divulgação. *Discurso do Presidente da República. Pronunciamento do Presidente da República*, Luiz Inácio Lula da Silva, na cerimônia de lançamento do Programa Bolsa Família, de transferência de renda. Palácio do Planalto, 20 de outubro de 2003. p. 5. Disponível em:< http://www.biblioteca. presidencia.gov.br/presidencia/ex-presidentes/luiz-inacio-lula-da- silva/discursos/1o-mandato/2003/20-10-2003-discurso-do-pr-luiz-inacio-lula-da-silva-na-cerimonia-de- lancamento-do-programa-bolsa-familia.pdf/view>. Acesso em: 24 abril de 2018.

BRASIL. *Canal oficial do Ministério do Desenvolvimento Social no YouTube*. Lançamento do Novo Bolsa Família. 02 mar. 2023. Minutos 1:31:33 em diante. Disponível em: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=G_voqQYYknY&t=5494s. Acesso em: 24 maio de 2023.

BRASIL. *Lei n° 14.284*, de 29 de dezembro de 2021. Disponível em: https://www. planalto.gov.br/ccivil_03/_ato2019-2022/2021/lei/l14284.htm. Acesso em: 20 maio de 2023.

BRASIL. *Medida Provisória n° 1.164*, de 2 de março de 2023. Disponível em:< https:// www.planalto.gov.br/ccivil_03/_ato2023-2026/2023/mpv/mpv1164.htm>.

BRASIL. MP n° 1061, de 9 de agosto de 2021. Disponível em: https://www.planalto. gov.br/ccivil_03/_ato2019-2022/2021/Mpv/mpv1061.htm. Acesso em 24 maio 2023.

CAMARGO, José Márcio. Pobreza e Garantia de Renda Mínima. Opinião Econômica. Dinheiro. *Folha de S. Paulo*, 26 dez. de 1991. Acervo Folha Disponível em: < http://acervo.folha.uol.com.br/resultados/?q=josé+márcio+camargo+&site=fsp&periodo=acervo&x=13& y=13>. Acesso em: 29 set. de 2017.

CONSTANTINO, Luciana. Petista Convoca Juramento Contra Pobreza. *Jornal Folha de São Paulo*. 05/02/2003, p. A 12.

Correio. Comitê agiliza sistema de distribuição de alimentos. set. 1993. n° 16.348. ArPU Correio do Triângulo n° 175.

Correio. MEC abre inscrições para bolsa-escola. p. A-2. 15 março de 2001. n° 18.674. ArPU Correio n° 265.

Correio. Miséria se alastra pelo nariz de Minas. Cidades, p. 9. 4 julho de 1993. n° 16.291. ArPU Correio n° 173.

DE SORDI, Denise. *Reformas nos Programas Sociais brasileiros*: Solidariedade, Pobreza e Controle Social (1990-2014). Tese de doutoramento. História Social. Universidade Federal de Uberlândia (UFU). 2019.

DE SORDI, Denise; GONÇALVES NETO, W. A Educação nos Programas Sociais brasileiros: Pobreza e Trabalho. *Educação & Realidade*, v. 46, n. 3, p. 1-22, 2021.

DE SORDI, Denise. Reformas nos Programas Sociais brasileiros: solidariedade, pobreza e controle social. *Revista Tempos históricos*, v.25, p.70-106, 2021.

DE SORDI, D. Empobrecimento, fome e pandemia: o Auxílio Emergencial, o fim do

Programa Bolsa Família e o Auxílio Brasil, 2019-2022. *História, Ciências, Saúde – Manguinhos*. v.30, p. 1-20, 2023.(a)

DE SORDI, D. Programas Sociais brasileiros e a desativação da esfera pública. *Locus Revista de história.* v. 29, n. 1, p. 203-221, 2023.(b)

DRAIBE, Sônia. A política social no período FHC e o sistema de proteção social. *Tempo Social*, USP, São Paulo, 2003, v. 15, n. 2, pp. 63-101.

FENELON, Déa. Resenha do livro História Social da Criança Abandonada. Anos 90, Porto Alegre, jul. de 1999, n.11, p. 186-193.

GOHN, Maria da Glória. A Ação da Cidadania Contra a Miséria e Pela Vida – Ou quando a fome se transforma em questão nacional. In: *Formas de Combate e Resistência à Pobreza.* Luiz Inácio Gaiger (org.). São Leopoldo: Ed. Unisinos, 1996. p.23-58.

GOHN, Maria da Glória. *Teorias dos Movimentos Sociais* – Paradigmas clássicos e contemporâneos. São Paulo: Edições Loyola, 1997.

JESUS, Wilma Ferreira de. *Poder público e movimentos sociais* – Aproximações e distanciamentos. Uberlândia 1982-2000. Dissertação de Mestrado. Programa de Pós-Graduação em História. Universidade Federal de Uberlândia, 2002.

JUSTO, Carolina Raquel Duarte de Mello. *Política de Transferência de Renda e Cidadania no Brasil*: Implicações Político-Sociais dos Programas Municipais de Renda Mínima a partir do Estudo Comparativo dos casos de Campinas, Jundiaí, Santo André e Santos (1995-2006). Tese de doutorado UNICAMP, Campinas, SP, 2007.

LACERDA, Paula. Estado, gênero e Covid-19: Trânsito de mulheres por setores da administração pública em tempos de pandemia. *Mana*, 2022, v. 1, n. 28, pp.1-33.

LARA, Tiago Adão. Ação da Cidadania. *Correio*. Opinião, p. 4. 30 jul. 1993. n° 16.313. ArPU Correio do Triângulo n°173.

LINEBAUGH, Peter. Ypsilanti – Vampiros rondam o dia do trabalho. *Tempos Históricos,* Cascavel, 2018, v. 22, pp. 331-369.

MARINS, Mani Tebet. Repertórios individuais e estratégias individuais de beneficiários do Bolsa Família. *Sociologia & Antropologia*, out. 2014, Rio de Janeiro, v. 4, n. 2, pp. 557-558.

MAURIEL, Ana Paula Ornellas. *Combate à pobreza e desenvolvimento humano*: impasses teóricos na construção da política social na atualidade. Tese de doutorado. Programa de Pós-Graduação em Ciências Sociais. Unicamp: 2008.

Memória Roda Viva. Roda Viva. Fundação Padre Anchieta ; Labjor; Nepp. *Herbert de Souza*. 6 jan. 1992. p.4 e p. 8. Disponível em: < http://www.rodaviva.fapesp.br/materia/494/entrevistados/herbert_de_souza_betinho_1992.htm>. Acesso em: 16 ago. 2017.

MONTAÑO, Carlos. *Terceiro setor e questão social*: crítica ao padrão emergente de intervenção social. São Paulo: Cortez, 2010.

MORAIS, S. P. *Empobrecimento e "inclusão social"* - vida urbana e pobreza na cidade de Uberlândia/MG (1980-2004). Tese de doutorado. História. Pontifícia Universidade Católica de São Paulo (PUC-SP). 2007.

MORAIS, S. P. *Incluídos?* pobreza e políticas compensatórias em um Brasil rico. Saarbrücken: Editorial Academica Española, 2012.

MOREIRA, G. Sem-teto lutam diariamente. *Correio*. Cidades, p. A 6. 7 jul. 2003. n° 19.442. ArPU n° 293.

MOREIRA, Gustavo. Caixa distribui Bolsa Família amanhã / Bolsa Escola passa por recadastramento. *Correio*. Cidade, p. B 1. 22 out. 2004. n° 19.915. ArPU n° 308.

MOREIRA, Gustavo. Vivendo e Aprendendo – Projeto acolhe e ensina cidadania às crianças do Guarani. *Correio*. Cidade, p. B 2. 13 set. 2006. n° 20.241. Ar PU Correio 325.

OLIVEIRA, Romilda Aparecida Cardoso de. *A Construção do Bairro Mansour na Memória dos Moradores* – Uberlândia (1992-2003). Monografia. Instituto de História da Universidade Federal de Uberlândia, 2003.

PINTO, Céli Regina Jardim. A sociedade civil e a luta contra a fome no Brasil. *Sociedade e Estado*, Brasília, jan./abr. 2005, v. 20, p. 222.

REZENDE, Fernando (org.). *Ana Peliano*: uma batalha incansável contra a fome, a pobreza e a desigualdade social. Brasília, IPEA: 2022.

ROCHA, Sonia. *Transferências de Renda*: o fim da pobreza. Rio de Janeiro: Elsevier, 2013.

RUIZ, Antonio Ibanez. A gente não quer só comida. Folha de S. Paulo, pp. 1-3, 14 abril 1994.

SALES, Tainah Simões. *O Estado, a pobreza e o Programa Bolsa Família.* Curitiba: Editora Prismas, 2015.

SCHWARZ, Roberto. *As ideias fora do lugar:* ensaios selecionados. São Paulo: Penguin Classics Companhia das Letras, 2014.

SHIKI, S.; NEDER, H. D. (Org.); *Condições Sócio-Econômicas das Famílias na Periferia de Uberlândia.* CEPES / UFU. Uberlândia, fevereiro de 1996. pp. 97-101.

SILVA, Maria Ozanira da Silva e. *A política social brasileira no século XXI*: a prevalência dos programas de transferência de renda. São Paulo: Cortez, 2014.

SOARES, Laura Tavares. Focalização versus Universalização. In: *Enciclopédia Latino Americana*. São Paulo: Boitempo. Disponível em: http://latinoamericana.wiki.br/verbetes/f/focalizacao-versus-universalizacao>. Acesso em: 24 maio de 2023.

SOARES. Famílias carentes recebem cestas básicas. *Correio*. Cidade & Região, p. A 4. 25 dez. 2012. n° 22.902. ArPU n° 412.

SPOSATI, Aldaíza. Bolsa Família: Um programa com futuro(s). In: *Bolsa Família 2003-2010*: avanços e desafios (v. 2). Jorge Abrahão de Castro, Lúcia Modesto (org.). Brasília: Ipea, 2010. p. 273-306.

SUPLICY, Eduardo Matarazzo. *Renda de Cidadania*: a saída é pela porta. São Paulo: Cortez: Fundação Perseu Abramo, 2002.

TELLES, Vera da S. *Pobreza e Cidadania.* São Paulo: Programa de Pós-Graduação em Sociologia da FFLCH-USP/Editora 34, 2013.

VIOLIN, Tarso Cabral. *Terceiro Setor e as parcerias com a administração pública*: uma análise crítica. Belo Horizonte: Fórum, 2010.